



**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE
HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING**

DRAFT MINUTES

Monday, December 10, 2018

**Scottsdale Community Design Studio
7506 E Indian School Road
Scottsdale, Arizona 85251**

PRESENT: Janice Shimokubo, Chair
Nadia Mustafa, Vice Chair (telephonic)
Laurie Coe, Commissioner
James Eaneman, Commissioner
Emily Hinchman, Commissioner
Hannellie Mendoza, Commissioner
Stuart Rhoden, Commissioner

STAFF: Sharon Cini
Brent Stockwell
Christy Hill
Stanna Slater

Call to Order/Roll Call

Chair Shimokubo called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

Public Comment

1. Approval of minutes from the October 8, 2018 meeting

COMMISSIONER EANEMAN MOVED TO APPROVE THE OCTOBER 8, 2019 HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES. COMMISSIONER RHODEN SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0). CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-

CHAIR MUSTAFA, COMMISSIONERS COE, EANEMAN, HINCHMAN, MENDOZA, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE.

Chair Shimokubo congratulated Sharon Cini for being a recipient of the CCD and acknowledged as a Diversity Champion. She will be honored at the MLK Dinner on January 16, 2019.

2. Presentation, discussion and recommendations on 2018 Scottsdale hate crimes report

Sharon Cini reviewed the 2018 Scottsdale hate crimes report that was provided to the Office of Diversity by the Scottsdale Police Department. She noted that the fourth quarter statistics will be available in January. Scottsdale ranks similarly to neighboring Valley cities with the exception of Phoenix, whose reported hate crimes increased by approximately 12 percent over last year.

Chair Shimokubo noted that the 2017 FBI report indicated a 17 percent increase nationwide from 2016 to 2017, with 37 percent of the increase being anti-Semitic. She suggested that the information be considered as part of the strategic planning discussion.

Commissioners expressed an interest in identifying the "under-reported" incidents and defining what a hate crime is. Chair Shimokubo suggested that the Commission could invite Chief Rodbell to speak on the subject again in the coming year.

Ms. Cini indicated that the Office of Diversity is working with the LGBT Liaison to identify effective ways to educate the public about resources available to those experiencing a hate crime in Scottsdale, including communicating with the Office of Diversity, the Human Relations Commission, and the LGBT Liaison. Although Scottsdale has no specific LGBT protections, EEOC laws and other protections can be referenced.

Commissioners indicated an interest in readdressing the anti-discrimination ordinance with City Council. Ms. Cini suggested that an effective approach would be for the Human Relations Commission to work directly with their community partners.

3. Presentation and discussion regarding the 2018 National Citizen Survey

Brent Stockwell gave an update on the 2018 National Citizen Survey. The surveys were mailed out in early December to three different geographical areas of the City and will be returned by the end of the month. An online survey will be available for interested citizens during the month of January.

Mr. Stockwell noted that the national citizen survey is in English and includes a paragraph in Spanish asking participants who need assistance to ask a friend for help or to call the Paiute Neighborhood Center and someone can assist them in completing the survey. Questions that were added to the survey relate to connecting with new residents, demonstrating respect for others, and fairness with law enforcement.

Final survey results are expected to be available in early February.

Brief discussion ensued regarding how the final survey results can be used for benchmarking with other communities and rating areas that are important to the citizens of Scottsdale. Commissioner Rhoden expressed an interest in using the survey data as a kickoff point for "Dinner and Dialogue" events or forming a focus group to dig deeper into the information.

4. Presentation, discussion and recommendations regarding staff diversity updates

- 2018 Annual HRC report

Ms. Cini presented a draft of the annual report and reviewed the major areas that will be highlighted in the 2018 annual report. She asked Commissioners to review the document and contact her with any suggestions for additions no later than December 26, 2018.

The final report will be presented for approval during the January HRC meeting and the final document will be presented to Mayor Lane's office.

- Review Bylaws for Process and Procedure for Chair and Vice-Chair elections in January 2019

Ms. Cini reviewed the process for election of Chair and Vice Chair of the Commission, which will take place during the first meeting in January. Nominations are due to Ms. Cini's office no later than December 26th.

- Community outreach and events

Ms. Cini reviewed the list of upcoming events and invited Commissioners to RSVP to her for the events they are interested in attending. She noted that there are seats available for the "A Celebration" event being hosted by the Asian Corporate and Entrepreneur Leadership organization. Several Commissioners have already confirmed attendance for the MLK Dinner.

Commissioners discussed the importance of taking advantage of outreach opportunities, much as was done at the Rainbow Festival, Dia de los Muertos, and the Asian Festival. Several opportunities will be available throughout the year. Ms. Cini suggested having a Scottsdale for All outreach booth at Peace and Community Day. She invited Commissioners to attend the Arizona Native Experience and the Arizona Indian Festival in February.

5. Presentation, discussion and recommendations regarding Scottsdale for All community diversity campaign

Vice-Chair Mustafa gave an update on Scottsdale for All campaign outreach activities. She said that Experience Scottsdale offered a half-page space to the Scottsdale for All campaign in their annual visitors guide. The Scottsdale Chamber of Commerce has offered to run a news release in the near future. In addition, the Scottsdale Progress recently released an article covering general issues on diversity in the Valley.

In response to comments made during the meeting with Experience Scottsdale, Chair Shimokubo put together a list of talking points for Experience Scottsdale to reference in response to visitors who are concerned that Scottsdale might not be a welcoming community.

Chair Shimokubo noted that in addition to staff time, approximately 280 hours have been contributed to the Scottsdale for All campaign so far.

RECESS TAKEN FROM 4:44 p.m. to 4:53 p.m.

6. Presentation, discussion and recommendations on 2019 Human Relations Commission strategic plan

Chair Shimokubo recalled that the strategic planning meeting held on June 11th was designed to be an informal preliminary discussion. The final discussion was postponed so that new commissioners would be able to participate.

Christy Hill reviewed the outcome of the preliminary strategic planning session and facilitated a discussion about the 2019 Strategic Plan. She reviewed the steps that would be taken as part of the evening's discussion and narrowing down the list of priorities. The group talked about the current global and local environment and areas of importance to the Scottsdale Community. They discussed the importance of being mindful of time constraints associated with projects and determined that the list should be narrowed down to three top priorities.

In response to concerns about the City of Scottsdale not having an antidiscrimination ordinance, Mr. Stockwell clarified the City's position. He stressed that the City of Scottsdale does have an antidiscrimination/non-harassment statement that applies to all City employees. City Council is reluctant to apply that requirement to businesses in the community because civil rights legislation has not been adopted at the state or federal level. The stance is consistent with many topics that transcend and impact all Arizonans, that laws should be passed by the Arizona Legislature if they apply statewide. Council believes that issues affecting primarily local government should be left at the city government level.

Commissioners reviewed the Preliminary Strategic Plan Project Plan list and discussed areas they would like to maintain, strengthen, and eliminate and narrowed the list down to three priorities to focus on in 2019.

Priorities for the 2019 Human Relations Commission Strategic Plan are as follows:

- 1) Scottsdale for All
- 2) Dinner and Dialogue (Diversity Talks)
- 3) Golden Rule

Adjournment

COMMISSIONER RHODEN MOVED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING. COMMISSIONER MENDOZA SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH CARRIED SEVEN (7) TO ZERO (0). CHAIR SHIMOKUBO, VICE-CHAIR MUSTAFA, COMMISSIONERS COE, EANEMAN, HINCHMAN, MENDOZA, AND RHODEN VOTED IN THE AFFIRMATIVE.

With no further business to discuss, being duly moved and seconded, the meeting adjourned at 7:09 p.m.

Recorded and Transcribed by eScribers, LLC.